

# Public Document Pack



Neuadd y Sir  
Y Rhadyr  
Brynbuga  
NP15 1GA

Dydd Mercher, 25 Ionawr 2017

**Hysbysiad o gyfarfod**

## **Pwyllgor Archwilio**

**Dydd Iau, 2ail Chwefror, 2017 at 2.00 pm  
Neuadd Y Sir, Y Rhadyr, Brynbuga, NP15 1GA**

### **AGENDA**

**BYDD CYFARFOD CYN I AELODAU'R PWYLLGOR 30 COFNODION CYN I'R  
CYCHWYN Y CYFARFOD**

<b>Eitem ddim</b>	<b>Eitem</b>	<b>Tudalennau</b>
1.	Ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb	
2.	Datganiadau o Fuddiant	
3.	Fforwm Agored i'r Cyhoedd	
4.	Cadarnhau cofnodion y cyfarfod blaenorol	1 - 12
5.	Nodi'r Rhestr Weithredu o 15 Rhagfyr 2016	13 - 14
6.	Adroddiad Cynnydd Ch3	15 - 24
7.	Asesiad Dilydol Asesiad Corfforaethol - Adnoddau Dynol	25 - 48
8.	Blaenraglen Gwaith	49 - 52
9.	Cadarnhau mai dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod nesaf fydd dydd Iau 16 Mawrth 2017 am 2.00pm	

**Paul Matthews**

**Prif Weithredwr**

## CYNGOR SIR FYNWY

### MAE CYFANSODDIAD Y PWYLLGOR FEL SY'N DILYN:

Cynghorwyr Sir:

P White  
J. Higginson  
D. Batrouni  
P. Clarke  
G. Down  
A. Easson  
D. Edwards  
P. Murphy  
P. Jordan  
B. Hayward  
J. Prosser  
B. Strong

### **Gwybodaeth Gyhoeddus**

#### **Mynediad i gopiau papur o agendâu ac adroddiadau**

Gellir darparu copi o'r agenda hwn ac adroddiadau perthnasol i aelodau'r cyhoedd sy'n mynychu cyfarfod drwy ofyn am gopi gan Gwasanaethau Democrataidd ar 01633 644219. Dylid nodi fod yn rhaid i ni dderbyn 24 awr o hysbysiad cyn y cyfarfod er mwyn darparu copi caled o'r agenda hwn i chi.

#### **Edrych ar y cyfarfod ar-lein**

Gellir gweld y cyfarfod ar-lein yn fyw neu'n dilyn y cyfarfod drwy fynd i [www.monmouthshire.gov.uk](http://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk) neu drwy ymweld â'n tudalen Youtube drwy chwilio am MonmouthshireCC. Drwy fynd i mewn i'r ystafell gyfarfod, fel aelod o'r cyhoedd neu i gymryd rhan yn y cyfarfod, rydych yn caniatáu i gael eich ffilmio ac i ddefnydd posibl y delweddau a'r recordiadau sain hynny gan y Cyngor.

#### **Y Gymraeg**

Mae'r Cyngor yn croesawu cyfraniadau gan aelodau'r cyhoedd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg. Gofynnwn gyda dyledus barch i chi roi 5 diwrnod o hysbysiad cyn y cyfarfod os dymunwch siarad yn Gymraeg fel y gallwn ddarparu ar gyfer eich anghenion.

# Nodau a Gwerthoedd Cyngor Sir Fynwy

## Cymunedau Cynaliadwy a Chryf

### Canlyniadau y gweithiwn i'w cyflawni

#### Neb yn cael ei adael ar ôl

- Gall pobl hŷn fyw bywyd da
- Pobl â mynediad i dai addas a fforddiadwy
- Pobl â mynediad a symudedd da

#### Pobl yn hyderus, galluog ac yn cymryd rhan

- Camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau ddim yn effeithio ar fywydau pobl
- Teuluoedd yn cael eu cefnogi
- Pobl yn teimlo'n ddiogel

#### Ein sir yn ffynnu

- Busnes a menter
- Pobl â mynediad i ddysgu ymarferol a hyblyg
- Pobl yn diogelu ac yn cyfoethogi'r amgylchedd

### Ein blaenoriaethau

- Ysgolion
- Diogelu pobl agored i niwed
- Cefnogi busnes a chreu swyddi
- Cynnal gwasanaethau sy'n hygyrch yn lleol

### Ein gwerthoedd

- **Bod yn agored:** anelwn fod yn agored ac onest i ddatblygu perthnasoedd ymddiriedus
- **Tegwch:** anelwn ddarparu dewis teg, cyfleoedd a phrofiadau a dod yn sefydliad a adeiladwyd ar barch un at y llall.
- **Hyblygrwydd:** anelwn fod yn hyblyg yn ein syniadau a'n gweithredoedd i ddod yn sefydliad effeithlon ac effeithiol.
- **Gwaith tîm:** anelwn gydweithio i rannu ein llwyddiannau a'n methiannau drwy adeiladu ar ein cryfderau a chefnogi ein gilydd i gyflawni ein nodau.

This page is intentionally left blank

# Public Document Pack Agenda Item 4

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00  
pm

**PRESENT:** Mr. P White (Chairman)  
County Councillor J. Higginson (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Batrouni, A. Easson, D. Edwards, P. Murphy,  
P. Jordan, J. Prosser and B. Strong

### **ALSO PRESENT:**

County Councillor V. Smith  
Mr. T. Lewis – Wales Audit Office

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Mrs. J. Robson – Head of Finance  
Mr. M. Howcroft – Assistant Head of Finance  
Mr. A. Wathan – Chief Internal Auditor  
Mr. R. Jones - Policy and Performance Officer  
Mr. M. Gatehouse – Policy and Performance Manager  
Mrs. T. Harry – Head of People and Information Governance  
Mr. P. Davies – Chief Officer for Resources  
Mrs W. Barnard – Democratic Services Officer

### **APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors P. Clarke and B. Hayward

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

Declarations of interest were declared as follows:

- County Councillor A. Easson: In relation to Monmouthshire Farm School Trust, a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an Elected Member of the Monmouthshire Farm School Trust as a Trustee.
- County Councillor R. J. Higginson: personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as MCC Appointee to East Wales Valuation Tribunal – relevant to non-domestic rates.
- County Councillor D. Edwards: In relation to Monmouthshire Farm School Trust, a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an Elected Member of the Monmouthshire Farm School Trust as a Trustee and in relation to Welsh Church Fund as Chair of the Committee.

#### **2. Public Open Forum**

There were no members of the public present.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

#### **3. To confirm minutes of the previous meeting**

The minutes of the Audit Committee held on the 17<sup>th</sup> November 2016 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

#### **4. To note the Action List from the 17th November 2016**

We received the Action List from the meeting held on the 17<sup>th</sup> November 2016. In doing so, the following points were noted:

- Redundancy Costs: This matter is included as an item on the agenda.
- Internal Audit Section Contract Procedure Rules and Exemptions: This matter is included as an item on the agenda.
- Non-domestic rates: Clarification from Ruth Donovan has been provided to Committee Members. The Chair invited observations and it was concluded that the information provided satisfied the queries raised and that it was understood that it is a matter for individual businesses to appeal. It was confirmed that the Council has previously made representations to Welsh Government.
- Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP): It was confirmed that the general and specific views of the Committee were added to the report as agreed and was considered and endorsed by Council at its meeting on 1<sup>st</sup> December 2016.

#### **5. Wales Audit Office Proposals for improvement progress report**

The Wales Audit Office (WAO) Proposals for Improvement Progress Report was presented.

It was explained that the report provides a progress update against WAO proposals made to the Council to support its development. The proposals are not statutory. A link was provided to the latest annual improvement report by WAO which consists of an overview of progress in 2015/16 and prospects for improvement in 2016/17. It was reported that "Based on and limited to, the work carried out by the Wales Audit Office and relevant regulators, the Auditor General believes that the council will comply with the requirements of the measure during 2016-17 provided it continues to maintain the current pace of improvement comments will comply with measures if maintains current pace of improvement".

It was explained that each proposal update highlights:

- The specific proposal, or more than one proposal if they are closely linked.
- The progress made up to November 2016 to address the issues identified by the proposal.
- Whether the status of the proposal is to remain "open" or be "closed" if the evidence of progress suggests it has been sufficiently addressed.
- Any further actions that will be taken to address the proposal.

The proposals are grouped as follows:

- Human Resources
- Performance Management
- Partnership & collaboration
- Governance

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- Finance

It was noted that the proposals issued include recommendations made on a national basis that may be relevant to the Council.

#### **6. Overview of Performance Management Arrangements**

An update on the effectiveness of the authority's performance management arrangements was presented.

Members were reminded that the Council's Performance Management Framework:

- translates political ambition into a series of Improvement Objectives
- places an expectation on teams to translate these into specific, measurable actions in their service plans
- contains a broad range of data to monitor impact and measure the performance of services
- requires employees to receive regular appraisal to demonstrate how they are contributing to the objectives

The arrangements for self-evaluation and respective scoring were explained.

At this juncture, Members were invited to make observations on agenda items 6 and 7.

A Member commented that there was a lot of work not scheduled for completion until next year and enquired if any planned improvements were not on track. It was responded that many proposals for improvement were issued in the last 12-18 months; some complex, others more straightforward. Most have been categorised as "open" with further work to do; each unique according to individual circumstances. It was confirmed that progress is broadly on track noting that some have longer timescales. It was suggested that the Committee revisits progress in 6-12 months. It was noted that many challenges face the authority and the value of scrutiny undertaken by Audit Committee and Select Committees was a key element to ensure the Council remains on course.

In response to a query it was confirmed that WAO advice was rejected and Cabinet minutes would not be published.

A Member questioned if the objectives were being addressed within an acceptable timeframe as some key issues would not be completed until early next year. It was added that following the election in May, the new councillors may not be as informed on these items, and consequently scrutiny may not be as thorough. It was responded that there were a number of reasons for the differing timescales for completion of objectives such as when the evidence might be available to confirm improvement and where work is ongoing. It was confirmed that there is a regular cycle of progress reports and that new Members elected in May 2017 will be offered briefings on different elements of the council's systems to include familiarisation with performance management reports and processes and an update on historical matters, including links to key documents.

A Member sought clarification regarding how the education objectives to improve attainment at all key stages are to be addressed. It was explained that the measure was in both absolute and relative terms (i.e. where the authority sits in comparison with other similar authorities as defined by eligibility for Free School Meals, and consequently to be within the best two/three

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

authorities in Wales). This would require improving upon or, at least, maintaining the previous year's position. It was explained that over the last three years, the rate of improvement is beginning to slow down and this is under analysis currently.

Regarding the staff appraisal system Check in Check Out, a Member noted that progress was "Adequate" only. Concern was expressed that systems were not in place to record when appraisals are completed. It was confirmed that it had been identified that more work was required to further define the process and to provide guidance to managers. Further refinement of the recording system was also required. It was explained that only 54% of staff were recorded as having completed appraisal. It was added that consideration is being given to developing a system that will capture rates of completion plus training analysis and other information to aid planning going forward.

A Member queried the method and frequency of re-evaluation by officers. It was explained that monitoring and evaluation is embedded in the existing performance management arrangements which include Service Improvement Plans and Action Plans for each team which require quarterly updates. Managers hold those responsible for actions to account and reports are brought to Audit Committee periodically to provide an overview of activity. The reports are available at all times on The Hub. The Leader of the Council uses the Service Improvement Plans as the basis of discussions with Cabinet Members regarding their respective portfolios.

A Member queried improvement objectives for the provision for additional learning needs, outcomes in schools and in the authority's youth service (in view of the 25% reduction in funding for youth services across Wales) as commented in Estyn's Monitoring letter in January 2016, and plans in relation to the recent PISA results that indicate that Wales appears well below average.

The global ranking of the PISA results was explained and it was explained that there is no local comparison available within Monmouthshire and that the basis of the tests are different to the national curriculum. The results relate to the performance of schools in Wales and UK.

It was explained that the Service Improvement Plan for the Youth Service has driven improvements in the service area noting that discussions with community councils are in progress to provide support. It was agreed to provide a more detailed response following the meeting.

A Member commented that PISA compares the UK countries with countries that provide schooling for up to 16 hours a day so there was no reasonable comparison, adding that the OFSTED Chief Inspector expressed the view that Welsh schools performed poorly because SATS are discontinued.

The Chair was provided with confirmation that there are specific targets for educational achievement. Results and the Chief Officer's Annual Report are scrutinised by Children and Young People Select Committee.

It was agreed that assurance had been sought on the operation of the authority's performance management arrangements and areas for further information identified as necessary.

#### **7. Audited Welsh Church Fund Trust Fund Accounts 2015/16**

The annual audited accounts for the Welsh Church Act Fund for 2015/16 were presented.

The following points were brought to the attention of the Committee:



## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- The Fund decreased in 2015/16 by £39,000 due to a paper revaluation of investment assets downward of £133,000.
- Income is mainly from investment income and was broadly comparable to previous years but slightly decreased due to depressed values of investment funds.
- Charitable expenditure was £129,000 broadly comparable to previous years comprising mainly of grant payments to applicants. It was explained that expenditure was less than budget this year due to Caerphilly CBC's approach that most applicants didn't meet the grant paying criteria causing a significant underspend. The other authorities in the region largely spent, or slightly underspent, their budgeted allocations.

Further information was provided that the market plummeted in March 2016 generally and the value of units purchased was less. It was explained that the Schroeder's Income Fund was valued at 2624 in March 2016 but is currently trading at 3065 and was one of the top 5 performers. More work on the UBS Multi Asset Account will be undertaken.

County Councillor D. Edwards made a declaration of interest in relation to a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an elected Member of the Welsh Church Trust Fund Committee. County Councillor B. Strong made a declaration of interest in relation to a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an Elected Member of the Welsh Church Trust Fund Committee and as a trustee of the Roger Edwards Trust.

#### **8. ISA 260 Report - Welsh Church Trust Fund**

County Councillor A. Easson declared an interest in relation to a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an Elected Member of the Welsh Church Fund Committee.

The report was presented. It was explained that the Auditor General issues an unqualified opinion on the financial statements of the Welsh Church Trust Fund.

#### **9. Audited Monmouthshire Farm School Trust Fund Accounts 2015/16**

County Councillor D. Edwards made a declaration in relation to a personal, non-prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct as an Elected Member of the Monmouthshire Farm School Trust Committee and also as a Trustee.

The report was presented. In doing so, it was explained the fund performed well and that there was less expenditure than income.

It was reported that income for the year comprised interest on investment stock (£23,000 compared with £5,000 the previous year) mainly due to having a large cash holding at the end of the previous financial year resulting in a larger return. Further investment led to a lower cash balance, but a higher investment return.

It was explained that similar to the Welsh Church Fund, there is an unrealised investment loss of £23,000 which is considered a paper loss which only materialises when sold when market conditions will account for values.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

It was explained that there is no ISA 260 for Monmouthshire Farm School Trust because it is an examination not a full investigation. The main issue raised is the Trust processing grants in advance of receiving the money from the Roger Edwards Trust.

#### **10. Independent examination of financial statements report - Monmouthshire Farm School Trust Fund**

The external audit report was presented noting that it was an audit examination not a full investigation. An unqualified opinion was issued. The timing element of issuing funds in advance of receipt of monies from the Roger Edwards Trust was raised as an issue.

A Member queried is there was anything that could be done to resolve the timing issue. County Councillor Strong offered to raise the matter with the Roger Edwards Trust.

It was confirmed that the accounts are produced within lawful timescales and properly audited. It was commented that it is usual to have late submission of accounts.

#### **11. Zero Hours Contracts**

The Committee was advised that this item had been referred by Council.

The term "Zero Hour Contract" and other similar descriptors were discussed noting that there is some interchangeability in definitions. It was explained that a Zero Hour Contract is a flexible contract where an employer does not guarantee set hours of work for an employee. The employee is contracted to that employer and cannot work for another employer. It was confirmed that Zero Hours Contracts are not used in Monmouthshire County Council.

In Monmouthshire, it was confirmed that specific contracts are used that are either temporary or permanent for a set number of part time or full time hours. If an employee is not employed on that basis, they are issued with a Casual Letter and the employee has no obligation to work. When offered work, the individual can choose whether or not to take up the offer. This arrangement allows the Council flexibility to employ people on a casual basis e.g. Playscheme workers – typically students looking for summertime employment.

It was explained that the aim is that no employees are treated inappropriately. It was clarified that some employees have casual hours' contracts mainly in Leisure Services e.g. Class instructors. It was explained that managers are expected to review such contracts to see if employees working regular hours should be employed on a part time or permanent basis.

A Member asked if the Trade Unions were satisfied with the Council's arrangements. It was confirmed, in respect of non-guaranteed hours, that specific guidance has been provided (appended to report). It was explained that part of the guidance suggests that negotiation is undertaken and no issues have been raised thus far.

A Member queried the position of employees working regular hours and their ability to be issued with a temporary or permanent contract. It was suggested that the information provided in the report was no different to information previously given. More detail from managers was requested to identify which posts are affected e.g. a 600 hour contract.

It was noted that County Councillor F. Taylor had written to the Committee with a list of questions and the Member commented that the information in the report did not fully provide answers. It was explained that, at the time of writing the report, the questions were not

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

available. It was clarified that of the two 600 hours post, only one is current. The post is based in Tourism, Leisure and Culture and is casual and there is no obligation for the employee to work. The Member queried if a seasonal, temporary and part time post should be included in this list. The rights of some Teaching Assistants was also queried, raising the question of term time only employees with no pay in school holidays and re-employed for the next term. The details of the enquiry were noted and a response will be provided regarding the employment practices of schools.

The definition of Zero Hours Contracts was further debated, suggesting that the numbers of casual employees had doubled in recent years and querying if the casualization of workers was due to budget constraints and more information on trends was sought and also employee feedback to reassure that those workers concerned genuinely want such arrangements.

With regards to Leisure, a manager has provided information that most casual employees are students who seek part time casual work to fit in with other commitments. Other part time employees have other part time work. If hours become regularised, they are reviewed with the employee to seek their views. In terms of Home Care, the rural nature of the county is a difficulty and effort is made to ensure employees are employed on the best basis, based around the requirements of the service e.g. minimum guaranteed hours are provided to assist employees with mortgage applications etc. and managers work with HR accordingly. It was agreed that the Council is not sighted on external agency providers of staff (e.g. home carers) in terms of zero hours contracts.

A Member reported that a constituent had encountered difficulties arranging swimming lessons for her disabled son as there was no instructor available, yet with the flexible arrangements and thirteen instructor on the list it was not possible to accommodate for some services.

A Member queried the inclusion of a Principal Librarian on the list and it was confirmed that the list is being checked for anomalies. It was commented that the actual figures can vary from day to day e.g. it is sometimes necessary to contact outside contractors to cover absence.

A Member stated that assurance was sought if the Council's approach is right and appropriate, and expressed his satisfaction that the responses given provided reassurance. It was queried if comparisons with other authorities was available. It was confirmed that the other authorities in the region were contacted but only Newport City Council responded.

It was commented that, in order to continue to keep some services operational, casual contracts may be utilised but also reassurance was provided that, where an anomaly is identified, it will be altered e.g. Care workers.

A Member asked a question about supply teachers and if they are directly employed or employed via an agency. In response, it was confirmed that the Council doesn't directly employ supply teachers. It was queried if this could be done "in-house" to avoid wasting money. The need for schools to react, respond and maintain full teaching complements was acknowledged and agreed that this was a topic under consideration nationally.

The Chair drew the attention of the Committee to the working conditions of agency workers noting that this could represent a reputational issue for Council. It was confirmed that agencies operate under a national contractual framework and therefore the terms and conditions should be in line with council policy to adequately meet certain conditions of employment.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

It was questioned if a review of contracts was possible and also provision of trends. It was suggested that this would be difficult to commit to due to capacity issues and the amount of time required for such an investigation. It was reported that there had been no complaints received.

Attention was drawn to the protocol for managers as a statement of policy. The view of the Committee was that reassurances had been received, the situation at present is satisfactory and that more information would be received in due course.

It was commented that two Members of the committee attend a national joint employer and trade union seminar twice a year and nothing about Zero Hours Contracts has been raised, similarly nothing has been raised in the Council's quarterly Joint Advisory Group with unions.

A member pointed out that many people on such contracts would not be union members and wouldn't be able to afford the fees, and that unions would not necessarily be sighted on the matter.

It was reiterated that union delegates have opportunity to raise questions and no concerns have been registered to date.

It was agreed that the Committee had looked more closely at these issues and more information had been requested.

#### **12. Early Departures and Redundancy Costs**

A report on Early Departures and Redundancy Costs was presented. It was noted that the report provided annual information and analysis as previously requested.

Members' attention was drawn to key points (Para 3.4) that provide reference to the reasons that early departures and redundancies arise in line with the Protection of Employment Policy such as end of grant funding for posts and restructuring and also exceptional circumstances where employment is terminated under a settlement agreement.

It was advised that the Accounts disclosure note is included in Appendix 1 and further analysis is provided in the tables in the report.

It was confirmed that considerable amounts are paid out as redundancy payments reflecting the current pressures in local government, however the actual amounts paid out 2015/16 compared with 14/15 were less. It was confirmed that in July 2016, a review of reserves was undertaken that highlighted the depletion of reserves in recent years. In respect of the Pensions and Redundancy reserve it was highlighted that there was a need for better workforce planning as already identified in the WAO Corporate Assessment, to redeploy where possible and to ensure clear cost savings from the removal of posts.

A Member queried how many Teaching Assistant posts had been lost during the last year noting that 80% of redundancies are women speculating that there could be a trend of lower paid women losing jobs. It was confirmed that information on Teaching Assistants will be provided to Members. With regard to the gender breakdown, it was explained that Appendix 2 confirms that the majority of redundancies are female and on lower grade posts. It was agreed that a high proportion of the workforce, especially lower paid postholders, are female and that a further breakdown of the proportion of redundancies in the workforce and grades would be provided.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

A Member queried the trend of redundancy/early departure costs for 16/17 year. The Member also queried the 6 figure salary banded redundancies and asked for further information. It was clarified that these were the actual salaries of those who had been made redundant (not including NI etc.) and did not accord with the payments made. It was added that there are now upper thresholds to payments capped at £95,000 and agreed that there are limited numbers of staff on 6 figure salaries applicable to the Chief Executive and Headteachers of schools.

In response to a Member's query it was confirmed that redundancy payments are subject to enhancement by a multiplier of 1.7 of the statutory amount in line with many other authorities in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom. This multiplier has been reduced in recent years as a result of the challenging financial climate.

It was asked that the gender balance information requested was breakdown by directorate.

Additional information was provided that the Month 6 monitoring report includes an estimation that redundancy costs for the year will be £690,000 excluding schools based staff. It was also explained that in the statement of accounts the calculation of a redundancy payment includes how long the employee has worked for the organisation plus the multiplier which may produce a payment that exceeds the annual salary.

The Officer was thanked for the report.

#### **13. Exemptions from CPRS**

A six monthly update on the Contract Procedures Rules Exemptions was provided.

#### **Key Issues**

- To ensure compliance with the Council's Contract Procedure Rules in the way goods, works and services are procured on behalf of the Authority.
- Reassurance that the exemption process from Contract Procedure Rules is operating as intended by managers procuring goods, works or services on behalf of the Authority.
- Some operational managers procuring goods, works and services on behalf of the Authority may not be as familiar with Contract Procedure Rules and the exemption process as they should be.

It was explained that the report referred to processes for the procurement of goods and services. Occasionally, the procedures will not be adhered to and officers have to justify to a Chief Officer when the rules are not applied.

It was noted that there are a range of exemption rules. Below £5,000 one written quote is required and for purchases between £5,000 - £25,000, 3 written quotes are required. For amounts exceeding £25,000 a tendering process must be undertaken.

A list of 13 exemptions for the last six months was provided. Eight have been authorised and returned to Internal Audit and five remain outstanding. An update on the five will be provided at

# MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

## Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

the next Audit Committee meeting. It was commented that there were no significant matters to report nor evidence of unsatisfactory trends.

A Member noted that of the thirteen exemptions listed, five were outstanding and it was queried if reasons were being sought why the matters remain outstanding. It was agreed that the five would be followed up and the information provided next time. It discussed that correct procedures should be followed and that the Audit Team should not have to chase information regarding outstanding reports. It was explained that follow up is undertaken for completeness and to ensure the system is not being bypassed. Reassurance was provided that the list of exemptions represents a very low proportion of the amount of procurement undertaken during the last six months.

A Member queried No. 199 and the reason why a member of staff had been commissioned as a specialist provider at a cost of £39,000. It was clarified that this was an agency arrangement rather than direct employment necessitating the use of a specific agency.

In response to a question, it was confirmed that there was no identifiable reason for the low level of application for exemptions and that applications were at an average level but can fluctuate dependent on procurement requirements.

### 14. Strategic Risk Assessment 2016

The Strategic Risk Assessment for 2016 for Monmouthshire County Council was presented.

#### Key Issues

1. The risk assessment ensures that:
  - Strategic risks are identified and monitored by the authority.
  - Risk controls are appropriate and proportionate
  - Senior managers and elected members systematically review the strategic risks facing the authority.
  
2. The existing risks on the Strategic Risk Assessment have been updated based on evidence available in 2016, as presented at Appendix 1. Changes to the council's risk management policy were approved by Cabinet in March 2015 and continue to be applied to the strategic risk register. These are:
  - including pre-mitigation and post-mitigation risk scores, this was also a key recommendation from scrutiny of the 2014 risk assessment
  - ensuring greater clarity to the phrasing of risk so that each statement includes an event, cause and effect as shown below:

Event	Cause	Effect
Risk of...Failure to...Lack of ...Loss of...Uncertainty of ...Inability to...Delay in...	Because of...Due to...As a result of...	Leads to...and/or... result in...

3. The risk assessment only covers high and medium level risks. Lower level operational risks are not registered unless they are projected to escalate within

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

the three years covered. These need to be managed and monitored through teams' service plans. The pre and post mitigation risk levels are presented separately. In most cases mitigating actions result in a change to the likelihood of the risk rather than the consequences as our actions are generally aimed at reducing the chance of a negative event occurring rather than lessening its impact. Clearly there will be exceptions.

4. Following presentation to select committees and audit committee, the risk assessment will be presented to Cabinet for sign off. The risk assessment is a living document and will evolve over the course of the year as new information comes to light. An up-to-date risk log is accessible to members on the Council's intranet - The Hub. This will ensure, as well as the ongoing specific scrutiny of the risk assessment annually, that select committees are able to re-visit the information at any point in the year to re-prioritise their work plan as appropriate.

Members' attention was drawn to two risks pertinent to the Committee.

Risk No. 4 refers to the potential risk that the Council does not make sufficient progress in areas of weakness identified by regulators leading to underperformance. It was explained that this risk was discussed earlier in the meeting and is covered in the WAO proposals paper. During discussion answers and assurances were given regarding the detail of the proposals. The risk is therefore recorded with the reason for its inclusion, a score indicating the likelihood of the risk occurring, mitigating and future actions, and a post-mitigation score.

Risk No. 9b refers to a potential risk that the Council did not having appropriate governance mechanisms when establishing new collaborative or alternative delivery models that are often complex and could impact on the shared ability to deliver objectives. This is common to other Councils currently. Whilst this matter has been included in the WAO proposals, members were invited to comment further.

A Member questioned the risk management process (para 2.2) and the assertion of the systematic challenge of Cabinet Members and Officers. It was agreed that this was a valid observation. It was confirmed that such challenge is the remit of Audit committee and also Select committees where it is suggested that the risk assessment is used as a basis for their work plan. Members were informed that the Risk Assessment document is continuously available on the Hub and updated as new information is available. Committees may consider the document or any risk at any point during the year.

A Member commented that the risks identified appear every year. It was confirmed that there is degree of consistency, however mitigating actions can alter the risk score. It was queried if a risk assessment item was lowered if it would it leave the list. It was explained that there is a matrix of high and medium level risks and lower level risks sit within team service plans, and managed at that level accordingly. The attention of Cabinet and Select Committees is drawn to risks pertinent to them, and the status and effect of mitigating actions accordingly.

A Member questioned Risk No. 11 in relation to Britain leaving the European Union and how any disadvantage can be overcome e.g. City Deal. It was commented that the high degree of

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Audit Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Thursday, 15th December, 2016 at 2.00 pm

risk is linked to uncertainty e.g. Legislation and funding changes and risk associated with unknown changes.

The Member added that current press report claim that Brexit could take 10 years and that this area of Wales can't wait this long for infrastructure changes. It was responded that this matter is under discussion by Strong Communities Select Committee, and as more information becomes available, risk levels will be reviewed.

The recommendations listed below were accepted.

1. That members consider the strategic risks presented for the next three years, in particular those of relevance to the committee and scrutinise the extent to which:
  - all relevant risks facing the authority are appropriately captured,
  - the level of risk applied is appropriate based on the matrix in the council's risk management policy and guidance (appendix 2) and
  - mitigating actions are proportionate and appropriate
2. That members use the risk assessment on an on-going basis to hold the responsibility holders to account to ensure that risk is being appropriately managed.
3. Use the risk assessment to inform the future work programme of the committee.

#### 15. **Forward Work Programme**

- CPR exemptions will be presented in June 2017 Meeting not February 2017
- Update of the Anti fraud and Corruption and Theft policy will be presented in March 2017
- WAO has invited comment on its forward plan 2017-20 by the end of January 2017. The consultation document will be circulated and comments may be e mailed to Joy Robson to collate and return to the WAO.

#### 16. **To confirm the date and time of the next meeting as Thursday 2nd February 2017 at 2.00pm**

The date of the next meeting of the Audit Committee was confirmed as Thursday 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2017 at 2.00pm.

**The meeting ended at 4.00 pm**



## Audit Committee Actions 15<sup>th</sup> December 2016

Agenda Item:	Subject	Officer	Outcome
Minute 6 (Agenda Item 7)	Overview of Performance Management Arrangements	Matthew Gatehouse – Policy and Performance Manager	Committee to revisit progress on improvement objectives in 6-12 months
Minute 6 (Agenda Item 7)	Overview of Performance Management Arrangements	Matthew Gatehouse  Tracey Thomas – Head of Youth Service	More detailed response on progress on improvement objectives in view of the 25% reduction in funding across Wales for Youth Services following the meeting
Minute 10 (Agenda Item 11)	ISA 260 Report – Monmouthshire Farm School Trust Fund		County Councillor B. Strong to raise timing of issue of funds with Roger Edwards Trust
Minute 11 (Agenda Item 12)	Zero Hours Contracts	Tracy Harry – Head of People and Information Governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Also, a breakdown of Teaching Assistant contracts and information regarding employment practices of schools in this respect.</li> <li>More information on casual posts future trends and reassurance that workers genuinely seek such employment arrangements.</li> <li>A Member's specific queries regarding the list of casual posts be responded to.</li> </ul>
Minute 12 (Agenda Item 13)	Early Departures and Redundancy Costs	Peter Davies – Chief Officer for Resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Members to be provided with details of redundancies amongst Teaching Assistants.</li> <li>Breakdown of the proportion of redundancies in the workforce by grade and gender by Directorate to be provided</li> </ul>
Minute 13 (Agenda Item 14)	Exemptions from Contract Procedures Rules	Andrew Wathan – Chief internal Auditor	Members to be provided with an update on the five outstanding exemptions plus reasons why outstanding

This page is intentionally left blank



**SUBJECT: INTERNAL AUDIT SECTION  
PROGRESS REPORT 9 Months into 2016/17  
– Q3**

**DIRECTORATE: Resources  
MEETING: Audit Committee  
DATE: 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2017  
DIVISION/WARDS AFFECTED: All**

## 1. PURPOSE

To consider the adequacy of the internal control environment within the Council based on the outcomes of audit reviews and subsequent opinions issued to the 31<sup>st</sup> December 2016.

To consider the performance of the Internal Audit Section over the first 9 months of the current financial year.

## 2. RECOMMENDATION(S)

That the Committee note the audit opinions issued.

That the Committee note the progress made by the Section towards meeting the 2016/17 Operational Audit Plan and the Section's performance indicators at the three months stage of the financial year.

## 3. KEY ISSUES

3.1 The Section is progressing through its programme of audits in accordance with the 2016/17 Operational Audit Plan.

3.2 This report gives brief details of the work undertaken in the year to date. The report also gives details of the Section's performance indicators for the 9 months to 31<sup>st</sup> December 2016.

3.3 The Public Sector Internal Audit Standards came into force in April 2013 which the Internal Audit team needs to demonstrate it is compliant with; these replaced the former Code of Practice for Internal Audit within Local Government. The new standards have been reported to the Audit Committee separately.

3.4 A requirement of the PSIAS is for the Internal Audit team to be externally assessed once every five years to ensure compliance with

these Standards. The Welsh Chief Auditors' Group proposed an option of a peer review in order to meet the requirements of this external assessment, which has been agreed by respective S 151 Officers of local authorities in Wales. Monmouthshire's peer review will take place during 2017.

- 3.5 The 2016/17 Audit Plan was agreed by the Audit Committee on 26<sup>th</sup> May 2016.

#### 4. REASONS

- 4.1 Since the start of the financial year, the Internal Audit Section has completed 33 audit jobs from its 2016/17 Operational Audit Plan, with several opinions issued; **Substantial x1, Considerable x4, Reasonable x3, Limited x2 with x3 Unqualified** and **x1 Qualified** Grant claims - these are listed in the table shown in Appendix 1.
- 4.2 The definitions of the four internal audit opinions and the risk ratings used by the Section are provided at Appendix 2 for Members' information.
- 4.3 Finalisation work from 2015/16 continues; of the 17 reviews at draft report stage at 31 March 2016, 16 have subsequently been finalised.
- 4.4 Audit management have also been involved with 5 special investigations to date this year, some of which have continued from 2015/16; these are often very sensitive and time consuming. Work has been undertaken on 4 unplanned area, providing additional advice and support for service managers.
- 4.5 Appendix 3 of the report gives details of the Section's performance indicators as at 31<sup>st</sup> December 2016.
- 4.6 The acceptance of audit recommendations was good at 98%. 31% of evaluation questionnaires have been returned from operational managers with 100% satisfaction rate; this measures how satisfied they were with the audit service they had received.
- 4.7 Draft reports have taken 39 days to issue following receipt of management comments. It has taken 20 days to issue final reports. The main reason for this is the involvement of key staff in the audit team with special investigations during the year.
- 4.8 Getting audit reports out to service managers are key indicators. The audit management will endeavour to continue to turnaround the work within the target time set for draft and final reports.
- 4.9 The percentage coverage of the audit plan at 42% (40% 2015/16) is much the same as the period of the previous year but below the profiled target of 50% at this stage of the financial year. Management

will keep this indicator under careful review for the rest of the year to ensure that the audit coverage by the year end is as comprehensive as possible in order to provide as much assurance as possible. The operational plan will be re-prioritised to ensure the higher risk areas are covered by the year end if resources become an issue again.

- 4.10 The team started the year with a full complement of staff in the team and this has continued.
- 4.11 The new reporting format, aimed at improving the efficiency and effectiveness of audit work, is working well and has been positively received from operational management. Audit opinions have also been revised and updated in order to give a better understanding of the level of assurance gained from undertaking the audit work. These have previously been presented to Audit Committee and are shown at Appendix 2.
- 4.12 In Quarter 1 the team get involved with the verification and validation of the Council's annual performance indicators before they are submitted to Welsh Government. This is often a time consuming exercise with tight timescales. The team are also involved with the administration of the National Fraud Initiative (NFI) data sets on behalf of the Council.

## **5. SERVICE MANAGEMENT RESPONSIBILITIES**

- 5.1 Heads of Service and service managers are responsible for addressing any weaknesses identified in internal systems and demonstrate this by including their management responses within the audit reports. When management agree the audit action plans they are accepting responsibility for addressing the issues identified within the agreed timescales.
- 5.2 Ultimately, managers within MCC are responsible for maintaining adequate internal controls within the systems they operate and for ensuring compliance with Council policies and procedures. All reports, once finalised, are sent to the respective Heads of Service for information and appropriate action where necessary.

## **6. FOLLOW UP AUDIT REVIEWS**

- 6.1 Where limited assurance opinions (previously unsatisfactory and unsound opinions) are issued, they are followed up within a twelve month timescale to ensure that the agreed actions have been taken by management and that the internal control systems are improved. These will be reported separately to the Audit Committee.

6.2 For other audit reports, updates on the progress towards implementation of the agreed action plans are requested from Managers and these are subject to verification testing on a sample basis.

**7. RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS**

None.

**8. CONSULTEES**

Head of Finance

**Results of Consultation:**

N/A

**9. BACKGROUND PAPERS**

Operational Audit Plan 2016/17

**10. AUTHORS AND CONTACT DETAILS**

Andrew Wathan, Chief Internal Auditor  
Telephone: x.4243  
Email: [andrewwathan@monmouthshire.gov.uk](mailto:andrewwathan@monmouthshire.gov.uk)

David Walton, Audit Manager  
Telephone: x.4258  
Email: [davewalton@monmouthshire.gov.uk](mailto:davewalton@monmouthshire.gov.uk)

**AUDIT COMMITTEE FEBRUARY 2017**

**INTERNAL AUDIT SECTION PROGRESS REPORT Q3  
2016/17 – 9 MONTHS**

**APPENDIX 1**

Internal Audit reviews from the 2016/17 Operational Audit Plan where fieldwork has been completed and/or final reports issued since 1/4/16 are listed in the table below.

Internal Control Opinions give the auditor's overall conclusion on the control environment operating in each system/establishment under review. Opinions range from 'Substantial assurance' through to 'Limited assurance'.

Draft issued indicates that a draft report has been issued and a response is awaited from the client before the report can be finalised.

**Internal Audit Services - Management Information for 2016/17 – Quarter 3**

Job number	Directorate	Service	Job Name	Risk Rating / Priority	Status	Opinion given
P16/17/38	Children & Young People	Schools	Llantilio Pertholey	Low	Final	Substantial
P16/17/21	Chief Executive's	Policy & Engagement	Performance Indicators - NSI, PAM, SIDS	Medium	Draft	Considerable
P16/17/40	Children & Young People	Schools	Pupil Referral Service	Low	Final	Considerable
P16/17/45	Enterprise	Community-led Delivery	County Farms	Medium	Final	Considerable
P16/17/64	Social Care & Health	Older People's Direct Care Services	Mardy Park	Low	Final	Considerable
P16/17/14	Chief Executive's	Operations	Transport Unit - Leased Vehicles	Medium	Draft	Reasonable
P16/17/18	Chief Executive's	Operations	Garden Waste	Low	Final	Reasonable
P16/17/78	Corporate		Annual Governance Statement	Not Applicable	Draft	Reasonable
P16/17/16	Chief Executive's	Operations	School Meals	Medium	Draft	Limited
P16/17/47	Enterprise	Community-led Delivery	Events (in progress)	Medium	Draft	Limited
P16/17/26	Children & Young People	Standards	Education Improvement Grant	Medium	Final	Unqualified
P16/17/27	Children & Young People	Standards	Pupil Deprivation Grant	Low	Final	Unqualified
P16/17/28	Children & Young People	Standards	Outside of School Childcare Grant	Low	Final	Unqualified
P16/17/60	Social Care & Health	Adult Services	Supporting People Grant Claim	Medium	Draft	Qualified



## Value Added Work

<b>Job Number</b>	<b>Directorate</b>	<b>Service</b>	<b>Job Name</b>	<b>Opinion given</b>
P16/17/04	Chief Executive's	Democracy & Regulatory Services	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/12	Chief Executive's	Finance	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/20	Chief Executive's	Operations	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/25	Children & Young People	Resources	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/30	Children & Young People	Standards	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/31	Children & Young People	21st Century Schools	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/41	Children & Young People	Schools	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/43	Children & Young People		Follow-up of Audit Recommendations	Not applicable
P16/17/49	Enterprise	Community-led Delivery	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/53	Enterprise	Commercial & People Development	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/57	Enterprise	Tourism, Leisure & Culture	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/61	Social Care & Health	Adult Services	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/63	Social Care & Health	Children's Services	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/65	Social Care & Health	Older People's Direct Care Services	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/66	Social Care & Health	Social Care & Health Finance Unit	Audit Advice	Not applicable
P16/17/70	Corporate		BACS - Compliance with SHA-2 protocols	Not applicable
P16/17/76	Corporate		National Fraud Initiative	Not applicable
P16/17/78	Corporate		Annual Governance Statement	Not applicable

**Internal Audit Opinions**

Each report contains an opinion which is an overall assessment of the control environment reviewed. Opinions were revised during 2015/16 to reflect a better understanding of the level of assurance given. The full list of audit opinions to be used from 2016/17 onwards is shown below:

<b>SUBSTANTIAL</b>	<p>Substantial level of assurance.</p> <p>Very well controlled, with numerous strengths identified and any risks being less significant in nature.</p>
<b>CONSIDERABLE</b>	<p>Considerable level of assurance</p> <p>Generally well controlled, although some risks identified which should be addressed.</p>
<b>REASONABLE</b>	<p>Reasonable level of assurance.</p> <p>Adequately controlled, although risks identified which could compromise the overall control environment. Improvements required.</p>
<b>LIMITED</b>	<p>Limited level of assurance.</p> <p>Poorly controlled, with unacceptable levels of risk. Fundamental improvements required urgently.</p>

**Unqualified** opinion - the terms and conditions of the grant were generally complied with;

**Qualified** opinion - the terms and conditions of the grant were not fully complied with

**AUDIT COMMITTEE FEBRUARY 2017**

**INTERNAL AUDIT SECTION PROGRESS REPORT Q3  
2016/17 – 9 MONTHS**

**APPENDIX 3**

**Performance Indicators**

	<b>2015/16</b>	<b>Q1</b>	<b>Q2</b>	<b>Q3</b>	<b>Q4</b>	<b>Target</b>
1	Percentage of planned audits completed	14%	23%	40%	74%	(80% pa)
2	Percentage of audits completed within planned time	0%	50%	33%	27%	60%
3	Average no. of days from audit closing meeting to issue of a draft report	3 days	17 days	52 days	75 days	12 days
4	Average no. of days from receipt of response to draft report to issue of the final report	12 days	34 days	46 days	22 days	5 days
5	Percentage of recommendations made that were accepted by the clients	100%	99%	99%	97%	90%
6	Percentage of clients at least 'satisfied' by audit process	N/A	N/A	N/A	100%	90%
7	Percentage of directly chargeable time (actual v planned)	94%	81%	120%	91%	100%
8	Number of special investigations	6	7	9	10	

	<b>2016/17</b>	<b>Q1</b>	<b>Q2</b>	<b>Q3</b>	<b>Q4</b>	<b>Target</b>
1	Percentage of planned audits completed	13%	33%	42%		35% (80% pa)
2	Percentage of audits completed within planned time	0%	56%	40%		60%
3	Average no. of days from audit closing meeting to issue of a draft report	3 days	30 days	39 days		12 days
4	Average no. of days from receipt of response to draft report to issue of the final report	12 days	30 days	20 days		5 days
5	Percentage of recommendations made that were accepted by the clients	100%	98%	98%		90%
6	Percentage of clients at least 'satisfied' by audit process	N/A	100%	100%		90%
7	Percentage of directly chargeable time (actual v planned)	102%	103%	102%		100%
8	Number of special investigations	2	4	5		

N /A – not available

This page is intentionally left blank



WALES AUDIT OFFICE  
SWYDDFA ARCHWILIO CYMRU

Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru  
Auditor General for Wales

# Human Resources Corporate Assessment Follow-on Review – **Monmouthshire County Council**

Audit year: 2015-16

Date issued: December 2016

Document reference: 486A2016

This document has been prepared as part of work performed in accordance with statutory functions.

In the event of receiving a request for information to which this document may be relevant, attention is drawn to the Code of Practice issued under section 45 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The section 45 code sets out the practice in the handling of requests that is expected of public authorities, including consultation with relevant third parties. In relation to this document, the Auditor General for Wales and the Wales Audit Office are relevant third parties. Any enquiries regarding disclosure or re-use of this document should be sent to the Wales Audit Office at [info.officer@audit.wales](mailto:info.officer@audit.wales).

The team who delivered the work comprised Avril Watkins and Emily Owen.

# Contents

The Council has made good progress in planning, managing and engaging its workforce although further work remains to ensure that managers have better baseline workforce data and HR ICT provision and that all staff have their annual appraisal.

## Summary report

### Detailed Report

The Council is developing its future operating business model, but does not yet have robust baseline data to underpin workforce planning activity and to shape its workforce for the longer term. 7

The Council has implemented most of its planned improvement actions within its People and Organisation Development business plan, with remaining actions underway, but accountability is not clear and it is not yet able to fully demonstrate improved outcomes. 9

The Council has improved its approach to staff appraisals but not all staff are having their annual appraisal completed. 11

The Council's Human Resources support is good, although there are some areas for further development such as HR ICT support. 12

The Council is acting on feedback from its staff, and during 2016-17 plans to further develop its approach to staff engagement. 13

# Summary report

## Summary

- 1 Effective management of staff is essential for transforming the delivery of public services, improving outcomes for citizens and delivering savings. The ways in which a council deploys and manages its staff can support different ways of working, help it deliver services differently, engage with citizens and help enable a council to achieve better-value services for its citizens. The way in which a council manages its people has a direct impact on: the efficiency, effectiveness and quality of work undertaken across the council; its work with its partners and other stakeholders; and on its communities and citizens. Poor or ineffective people management will lead to a less effective use of a council's most valuable and expensive asset – the staff it employs.
- 2 In March 2015, the Wales Audit Office carried out a Corporate Assessment at Monmouthshire County Council (the Council). In respect of human resource management, our assessment considered whether the Council had effective arrangements in place to manage and utilise its workforce.
- 3 Our Corporate Assessment concluded that the Council had developed a People and Organisational Development Strategy; however, to make the best use of its people resources, this strategy needed to be underpinned by organisation-wide workforce planning, complete and accurate workforce data and a fully implemented, whole-council appraisal process. We came to that conclusion because:
  - the Council had developed a People and Organisational Development Strategy, but gaps remained in its strategic approach to effectively managing the workforce;
  - integrated workforce planning was not being conducted on a council-wide basis and this could hinder the Council's achievement of its strategic priorities;
  - the Council's HR policies and plans did not maximise staff capacity and capability;
  - people management was not well supported by Information and Communication Technology (ICT) or managed strategically;
  - the Council had recognised that the HR service and model would not effectively support Council services to achieve planned improvements; and
  - the Council had put in place measures to engage with staff but it was too early to tell whether these were having an impact.



- 4 In our Annual Improvement Report 2014-15, where we summarised the findings from our Corporate Assessment, we made the following proposal for improvement: 'Develop the Council's workforce planning arrangements by including accurate data and key management information around workforce issues and statistics, reporting regularly to Senior Leadership and Management Teams to enable effective monitoring of progress and management of these issues on an ongoing basis.'
- 5 In April 2016, we reviewed the Council's progress in addressing the proposal for improvement relating to human resource management from the 2015 Corporate Assessment. We concluded the Council has made good progress in planning, managing and engaging its workforce although further work remains to ensure that managers have better baseline workforce data and HR ICT provision and that all staff have their annual appraisal. We came to that conclusion because:
- The Council is developing its future operating business model, but does not yet have robust baseline data to underpin workforce planning activity and to shape its workforce for the longer term
  - The Council has implemented most of its planned improvement actions within its People and Organisation Development business plan, with remaining actions underway, but accountability is not clear and it is not yet able to fully demonstrate improved outcomes
  - The Council has improved its approach to staff appraisals but not all staff are having their annual appraisal completed
  - The Council's Human Resources support is good, although there are some areas for further development such as HR ICT support
  - The Council is acting on feedback from its staff, and during 2016-17 plans to further develop its approach to staff engagement.

## Proposals for improvement: ongoing and new

- 6 We set out below the proposals for improvement made in our Corporate Assessment report where we feel that some further work is needed by the Council to address the proposals for improvement fully.

Corporate Assessment report's proposals for improvement needing further work
Engage more effectively with staff to ensure the Council's values are clearly evident across the organisation.
Ensure that the planned revisions and changes made to 'Check In Check Out' deliver a clear process of assessing and improving the performance of all staff and that department, team and individual objective setting is in line with the Council's corporate objectives.
Develop the Council's workforce planning arrangements by including accurate data and key management information around workforce issues and statistics, reporting regularly to Senior Leadership and Management Teams to enable effective monitoring of progress and management of these issues on an ongoing basis.

## New proposals for improvement

- 7 We have also proposed further improvements from this HR Corporate Assessment follow on review as follows.

HR Corporate Assessment	
P1	Develop further workforce data to include staff establishment, contract status, vacancies, agency use, age, gender, and grade/pay distribution, to better inform future workforce planning activity.
P2	Improve oversight and ongoing implementation of the staff appraisal process. In particular: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• ensure staff appraisal completion is uploaded onto the Council's Hub to accurately reflect the numbers of staff in receipt of an annual appraisal; and</li><li>• increase the appraisal completion rate.</li></ul>
P3	Further develop HR ICT systems to better support operational managers and improve recording of sickness and disciplinary matters.
P4	Improve the evaluation of HR improvement actions to better measure the impact and outcomes.

# Detailed Report

The Council has made good progress in planning, managing and engaging its workforce although further work remains to ensure that managers have better baseline workforce data and HR ICT provision and that all staff have their annual appraisal

The Council is developing its future operating business model, but does not yet have robust baseline data to underpin workforce planning activity and to shape its workforce for the longer term

The Council is starting to determine the future shape of the organisation but has not yet developed a workforce plan

- 8 In the 2015 Corporate Assessment, we concluded that the Council had developed a People and Organisational Development Strategy, but gaps remained in its strategic approach to effectively manage the workforce and integrated workforce planning was not being conducted on a council-wide basis and this could hinder the Council's achievement of its strategic priorities.
- 9 In January 2016, the Council set out its response to the Corporate Assessment in reports to Cabinet and the Audit Committee. In respect of workforce planning, the Council undertook to:
  - develop the future business model for the authority by March 2016;
  - use the business model to articulate the future workforce requirements of the authority including numbers of staff and skills needed by November 2016;
  - make reports covering key workforce statistics available to managers by May 2016; and
  - put in place arrangements to ensure systematic reporting to Directorate Management Teams and Senior Leadership Team by July 2016.
- 10 The Council continues to develop its future business model, which will be the foundation of its workforce plan. As at April 2016, the Council had not approved the future business model as it had anticipated in its response to the 2015 Corporate Assessment. The development of its workforce plan is therefore not yet complete, although it is taking action to develop such a plan.

The Council is developing tools such as workflows but still lacks quality data to support workforce planning

- 11 In preparation for the development of a council-wide workforce plan, the Council's People Services team has been developing the 'People Services Hub' (the Hub) on the Council's intranet to provide managers with guidance and tools for workforce planning. It has provided a 'Workforce Development Planning Workflow', to guide managers through the workforce planning process. The workforce development planning workflow covers four key stages of the process as follows: analysis, planning, implementation and review and evaluation. The workflow also explains how the workforce planning process will integrate with service planning processes. In addition, the People Services team has developed a 'Succession Planning Workflow', which is also situated on the People Services Hub. The Council has not yet formally evaluated the effectiveness of either of these workflows.
- 12 In the absence of a council-wide workforce plan, some managers have been preparing for the development of such a plan with guidance from its People Services team. The Social Care and Health Directorate has developed a strategic workforce action plan, covering the period December 2015 to December 2016 and the Council plans to use this as a template to implement workforce planning in its other directorates by November 2016.
- 13 The Council recognises, and is taking action to address, its lack of robust workforce data, which will be essential when it develops a workforce plan . One of the key actions in the Council's Social Care and Health Directorate strategic workforce action plan is to carry out data cleansing activity to ensure accurate and complete staff data showing: the directorate's establishment<sup>1</sup>; vacant posts; and usage and cost of agency staff. The Council's People Services Business Plan 2016-19 further acknowledges the need to improve baseline data with an action to: 'continue to develop accurate and robust systems, data and reporting to ensure a clear baseline of people and organisational data across all baseline activities to enable effective leadership'.
- 14 Managers do not have robust HR information to help them manage services strategically. Directorates currently receive quarterly data on sickness absence and staff turnover. Establishment information, vacancy data and information on agency staff is not yet robust. Managers do not receive information on the profile of the workforce, such as age, gender, ethnicity, disability, pay and grade distribution, nor comparisons, where appropriate, against other directorates and all-Wales corresponding demographic data.

<sup>1</sup> The establishment is the number of approved posts within the Council against which staff can be appointed.

The Council has implemented most of its planned improvement actions within its People and Organisation Development business plan, with remaining actions underway, but accountability is not clear and it is not yet able to fully demonstrate improved outcomes

The Council has set out its plans to better manage its human resources but responsibility for delivery is not clear

- 15 The Council response in January 2016 to our Corporate Assessment findings referred to in paragraph 5 above, committed it to 'deliver the actions in the programme plan of the People and Organisation Development Strategy 2014–2017 (the Strategy), which brings together the many facets of people and organisation development'.
- 16 The Strategy is structured around six themes and priorities as follows:
  - Our Work Environment
  - What we do to engage great people
  - What we do to attract and recruit great people
  - What we do to develop and retain great people
  - Diversity, Inclusion and Wellbeing
  - Bringing it all together
- 17 The Strategy clearly links to the Council's other strategies, including the IT strategy 'iCounty', Medium Term Financial Plan and Asset Management Plan. This provides an opportunity for the Council to manage the impact on its workforce from better use of technology, reduced funding and more effective use of resources.
- 18 The Strategy is supported by a People Services Business Plan 2016-17 (the Business Plan), which Cabinet approved in April 2016. The Business Plan includes actions that seek to help the Council address issues raised in our 2015 Corporate Assessment such as improving staff engagement, rolling out workforce plans across the Council and producing a People Services Annual Report that will include key staff measures.
- 19 The Business Plan sets out the Council's achievements in 2015-16 and the actions the Council plans to deliver during 2016-17. However, none of the actions specify who is responsible for their delivery or by when. As a result, senior managers and Members will find it difficult to assess whether progress made during the year is adequate and to hold officers to account for any perceived underperformance against the Business Plan.

**The Council reports progress in delivering the actions in its Strategy but cannot yet demonstrate how these have delivered improved outcomes**

- 20 The Council monitors progress in delivering the People Strategy and its Business Plan through a People Board (the Board). The Board comprises the Cabinet Member Resources, the Head of People and Commercial Development, interim HR Manager, Organisation Development lead, the Training and Development Manager and two staff representatives, who are members of the staff focus group, MonMinds. The Board meets approximately four times a year and includes a live-streamed session after the meeting where the Board answers questions on HR issues from participants.
- 21 The Council has continued to report its progress in delivering the actions set out in the Strategy to Members. For example, it recently reported to the Special Strong Communities Select Committee in March 2016 and Cabinet in April 2016, setting out its progress to date and next steps for the final year of the strategy in 2016-17.
- 22 The Council is able to demonstrate progress in the delivery of the majority of actions in its Strategy but not their impact on improving outcomes. For example:
- Of the 27 actions in the 2015-16 Business Plan, the Council reports that it is on target to deliver 20 of these actions and it has put in place steps to deliver the remaining seven actions. Where the Council has changed the focus of its planned action, it has reflected these in the 2016-17 Business Plan, indicating a strong focus on activity.
  - The Council is improving the skills of its managers. Some managers have achieved the Institute of Leadership and Management qualifications and 90% of managers have participated in the Council's coaching and mentoring training programme RESULT. The Council has adapted the training in response to feedback from participants by, for example, condensing the training into one day and by using language and terminology in the programme that is relevant to the specific staff groups. The Council has not yet assessed the benefits to the organisation from this investment in training.
  - The Council is responding to feedback from staff. It has developed and plans to introduce 'Coded pathways of learning and development'<sup>2</sup>. These identify links to the Council's values and behaviours and when launched are intended to provide essential and desirable training for all staff and leaders.

<sup>2</sup> Coded pathways – a one-page document for staff and management denoting the values and behaviours expected by the Council and aligned to this the essential and desirable training to be received, with a method of delivering the requisite training, specified for each training topic.

- Each service improvement plan now incorporates a scorecard of workforce measures such as; return to work interviews completed, number of accidents at work, average days lost to sickness per employee and number of annual staff appraisals completed. Whilst incorporating workforce data into the service improvement process is positive, at this stage this data is not used consistently to inform service planning.
- The Council is developing a set of key performance workforce measures that will form part of its report on overall corporate health. The HR measures include sickness statistics, percentage completion of the Council's appraisal Check in Check out, staff satisfaction percentage result, (obtained from the staff survey), number and progress of disciplinary cases.

### The Council has improved its approach to staff appraisals but not all staff are having their annual appraisals completed

- 23 In the 2015 Corporate Assessment, we concluded that the purpose of the Council's appraisal process, Check in, Check out was not well understood by staff, managers or Members. Some managers were not aware of the target set by the Council for the completion of appraisals and Check in Check out did not sufficiently identify training needs to enable the Council to develop a cohesive and co-ordinated corporate training plan. As a result, the Council could not be sure that all training met organisational needs, all skills gaps were being met or that overall training resources were being deployed effectively.
- 24 In January 2016, the Council set out its response to the Corporate Assessment in reports to Cabinet and the Audit Committee. In respect of the Check in Check out appraisal process the Council undertook to:
- revise and roll out the employee performance appraisal approach (Check in Check out) for staff and launch and communicate this by March 2016; and
  - ensure robust mechanisms are available to managers to complete accurate records on Check in Check out completion on the Hub, ensure ownership of these mechanisms and make quarterly measures available to monitor the process, by March 2016.
- 25 The Council's appraisal process Check in Check out requires all staff to receive an annual appraisal. There is no annual cut-off date for completion of appraisals as the Council's approach is for managers to conduct these on a rolling programme basis. This approach has some benefits, as logistically it is easier to manage, as not all staff appraisals are being completed at the same time each year. However, it relies on managers scheduling dates and conducting appraisals within an annual cycle.

- 26 The Council has reviewed its Check in Check out process to identify opportunities to improve its effectiveness and to increase take-up among staff. Its review sought views from across the organisation, including from its senior managers, People Services team, staff, through the staff conference, a staff survey and an established staff focus group – MonMinds. As a result of this review, the Council has changed the questions in its template appraisal form and since March 2016 made the revised process accessible to staff and managers on its People Services Hub.
- 27 During our 2016 review, the Council managers reported having a better understanding of the process and as there are only five questions to answer, they found the appraisal completion process easier to complete.
- 28 The Council has developed an online video for staff that explains what they can expect to happen during their appraisal and the video guides them through the process. At the time of our review, we were unable to assess the total number of views to date of this tutorial video.
- 29 For practical reasons, some services such as Waste and Street Services, have, in the past, modified the appraisal process to take account of operational logistics. The annual appraisal in these services is supplemented by a communication and engagement event called Tool Box Talks. Tool box talks allows managers to disseminate, on a group basis, important Council, directorate and service area messages and is an opportunity for staff to feed upwards questions and concerns. Other service areas supplement the appraisal with regular one to one conversations, between annual appraisals.
- 30 The Council provided us with six completed appraisal forms to review. We found that there were varying dates of completion, in line with the policy of rolling programme of appraisals, during the third and final quarter of the financial year. We also found that training and development needs were identified and methods of addressing these needs were noted. Training requirements of staff are collated corporately by the Council's corporate training function, which is called 'Talent Lab' and consists of a small team of three staff within the overall People Services team. The Council's training officers then undertake an organisation wide training needs analysis and organise training accordingly.
- 31 In 2015-16, the Council's People Services Annual Report showed a 52% rate of completion for appraisals. This is against a target of 100% rate of completion.



## The Council's Human Resources support is good, although there are some areas for further development such as HR ICT support

### Managers and staff are generally positive about the support they receive from the People Services team

- 32 The Council Managers we interviewed generally spoke positively about the support provided by the People Services Team, describing staff as helpful and professional. Managers did however raise some concerns that the limited capacity within the People Services Team had resulted, on occasions, in delayed responses to enquires such as during disciplinary investigations.
- 33 The Council launched the Hub in 2015 to provide easy access to the People Services Team. The Hub provides information on HR, Payroll, Training and Organisational Development. It includes a dashboard on workforce sickness and turnover rates at a directorate level and allows Managers to review their own team's sickness on a quarterly basis. The Council also plans to make the sickness reports available on its employee self-service portal My-View. Managers stated during our review that they found it easy to upload data on sickness and completion of Check in Check out appraisals. Appraisal data is also available in real time, via the Hub.
- 34 Managers we interviewed said they found the Hub to be user friendly and easy to navigate. The Hub provides 'frequently asked questions' and guidance that help managers understand processes and their roles and responsibilities within the processes. The Council continues to develop the Hub with recent additions of HR process workflows such as safe recruitment and attendance management. The introduction of the Hub has enabled managers to be more self-sufficient, and the Council has seen a reduced number of telephone and e-mail enquiries to the People Services Team, thereby releasing capacity within the team.

### The Council has developed ICT systems to support managers in their management of HR although some systems are yet to be fully developed

- 35 Managers input staff sickness data and can view the detailed data for their service area and other service areas on the Hub. Whilst the system records sickness details, the Council has not yet developed the system's further potential to record 'return to work' interviews, which is a key stage in managing attendance.
- 36 The People Services Team is developing a system to track progress in managing disciplinary cases, but until this is fully developed, managers continue to maintain their own records.

## The Council is acting on feedback from its staff, and during 2016-17 plans to further develop its approach to staff engagement

### The Council has committed to improving staff engagement

- 37 In the 2015 Corporate Assessment, we concluded that the Council had articulated its values and there was some evidence of this being demonstrated in meetings, however staff concerns existed in relation to openness, communication and decision making.
- 38 In January 2016, the Council set out its response to our Corporate Assessment in reports to Cabinet and the Audit Committee. In respect of staff engagement, the Council undertook to:
- ‘Deliver the actions in the programme plan of the People and Organisation Development Strategy, which brings together the many facets of people and organisation development, including continuing to develop our approach to colleague communication, following up from the ‘You said: we did’ week, with progress against the programme plan is to be evaluated by May 2016.’

### The Council engages well with staff, using a range of approaches to seek feedback on its performance

- 39 The Council established a staff focus group, which it called MonMinds. This group comprises between 40-60 staff from a variety of job roles within the Council. This group meets regularly, as and when required by the Organisation Development lead. The group typically discusses proposed ideas and innovations in relation to staff policies and practices the Council plans to introduce. This approach engages with a cross section of staff and allows staff to have a voice and share opinions on key issues and activities that affect them. The Council uses the group to test out ideas. An example of the Council acting on the group’s feedback was that the development of a one-page summary version of the People and Organisational Development strategy. The Council has also provided opportunities for staff to meet senior managers through its Mons Talk and Mons Delivers sessions. These meetings are similar to TED<sup>3</sup> talks that take place in other organisations.

<sup>3</sup> **TED** a non-profit organisation devoted to spreading ideas, usually in the form of short, powerful **talks** (18 minutes or less). They began in 1984 as a conference where Technology, Entertainment and Design converged, and today covers almost all topics — from science to business to global issues — in more than 100 languages.

- 40 The Council held two staff conferences, one in November 2014 and another in September 2015. The format of the 2015 event was shaped from feedback obtained from the 2014 conference and from discussion with MonsMinds. Six hundred staff attended the 2015 conference, which included a range of staff of different grades and roles including staff from schools. The conference provided an opportunity for senior managers to interact directly with staff. Some staff indicated at the 2015 staff conference and via MonMinds that they would prefer the Council to hold individual Directorate staff events in future. The Council confirmed that it plans to arrange a series of Directorate conferences in response to this feedback.
- 41 The Council's senior managers have responded positively to feedback from the 2014 staff conference where staff said they felt disconnected from senior leaders. The Council's Senior Leadership Team worked for a day on front line job roles and activities, such as street cleansing and in a youth centre. This provided senior officers with an opportunity to engage with service users and staff in their working environments where they may have felt more able to express their views more openly.
- 42 The Council's People Board meets approximately four times a year, to coincide with key staff events, such as before and after the staff conference. The meeting takes place in the Council chamber and once the meeting concludes staff and councillors are able to ask questions, via e-mail, of the People Board. These question and answer sessions are live streamed then stored on the Council's Hub and can be accessed after the event. During our 2016 review, we observed two sessions; the Council's first live-streamed session that was held on 3 July 2015 and the second that was on the 4 September 2015. In total 18 questions were received over the two sessions, covering topics such as recruitment, staff well-being and recognition, future senior leadership, front line engagement, date for the next staff survey and the format of the next staff conference. In April 2016, the recordings of the live-streamed sessions had been viewed 75 and 95 times since the events took place.
- 43 The Council asked staff, who attended its staff conference in November 2014, to indicate the extent to which they agreed with each of 10 questions.
- The most positive responses were to the questions:
- 'do you understand your purpose and contribution the Authority?'; and
  - 'if you have received training in the last 12 months, have you been able to use what you have learnt?'
- The most negative responses were to the questions:
- 'do you feel the authority lives and breathes its values?'; and
  - 'how interested are you in taking part in incentivised volunteering opportunities with the Authority?'

44 The Council undertook a staff survey in early 2015. It also engaged with staff during its “change week” at the end of June 2015 to share key messages from both the 2014 staff conference and the 2015 staff survey and to explain how the Council planned to respond.

45 The Council held a further staff conference in September 2015 and collated the main themes from sessions as an infographic. After the event, the Council shared the infographic across the organisation, to inform all staff of the key messages from the conference. The infographic shows the top five positive and negative themes as follows.

46 Positive themes identified were as follows:

- teamwork;
- managers and senior leadership support;
- integrated adult services;
- improved results in education; and
- still have a job.

The negative themes identified were as follows:

- increased workload, ability to take time off/more pressure;
- losing knowledge/expertise, officers leaving not replaced;
- IT- still lacking, slow and complicated;
- budgets limited/depth of cuts; and
- lack of communication.

47 The Council has not yet carried out a further staff survey or staff conference; therefore, it is not able to measure whether staff opinions have changed.



Wales Audit Office  
24 Cathedral Road  
Cardiff CF11 9LJ

Tel: 029 2032 0500

Fax: 029 2032 0600

Textphone : 029 2032 0660

E-mail: [info@audit.wales](mailto:info@audit.wales)

Website: [www.audit.wales](http://www.audit.wales)

Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru  
24 Heol y Gadeirlan  
Caerdydd CF11 9LJ

Ffôn: 029 2032 0500

Ffacs: 029 2032 0600

Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660

E-bost: [post@archwilio.cymru](mailto:post@archwilio.cymru)

Gwefan: [www.archwilio.cymru](http://www.archwilio.cymru)

## Management response

**Report title:** Human Resources – Corporate Assessment Follow-on Review

**Completion date:** December 2016

**Document reference:** 486A2016

### Relevant corporate assessment proposal for improvement that remains

Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
Original CA report P1  Page 43	Engage more effectively with staff to ensure the Council's values are clearly evident across the organisation	Assurance that the Council is delivering on its commitment to its staff around openness; fairness; flexibility and teamwork.	✓	Yes	<p>MonTalks and MonDelivers talks have been introduced to share insights, information and updates on a variety of aspects of the Council's work.</p> <p>Action has been taken to feedback from the staff conference and staff survey, while the People board continue to live stream question and answer sessions. Directorate level staff conferences will be established to provide more specific staff engagement on issues in their directorate. A follow on staff survey, including further questions on wellbeing, is also being developed.</p>	First Conference February 2017	Senior Leadership Team
Original CA report P3	Ensure that the planned revisions and changes made to 'Check In Check Out' deliver a clear process of assessing and improving the performance of all staff and that department, team and individual objective setting is in line with the Council's corporate objectives.	Assurance that the Council's appraisal process is an integral and effective part of the Council's performance management arrangements.	✓	Yes	<p>Based on feedback received, the Check in Check out process has been reviewed and rolled out with more robust guidance, video tutorials and supportive training. Work will continue to roll out, increase understanding and maximise completion of the check-in, check-out process.</p> <p>It was recognised that CICO completion rates are likely to be higher than reported at present as the system is not capturing all data in the most effective way. Recognising this, work is underway to investigate the possibility of developing a longer term more effective recording</p>	<p>March 2017</p> <p>April 2017</p>	<p>Head of people and information governance</p> <p>Head of people and information governance</p>

Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/ benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
					<p>module that would allow managers to record the CICO directly into an employee's record on the Human Resources system. This would allow for all employee data to be stored in one place and enable direct access to reports from the system identifying completion rates, training needs (which would automatically be fed through to the training team) and track progress on any actions agreed.</p> <p>While this longer term work continues, a basic interim reporting system is in place to monitor completion rates and ensure accountability for completion. The latest data shows of completed returns so far from Managers 70% of staff that require a CICO have completed a CICO in the required timescales. 20% of those not completed were scheduled for completion.</p>		
Original CA report P8	Develop the Council's workforce planning arrangements by including accurate data and key management information around workforce issues and statistics, reporting regularly to Senior Leadership and Management Teams to enable effective monitoring of progress and management of these issues on an ongoing basis.	Better planning of service changes in relation to current human resource capacity and skills and future needs.	✓	Yes	<p>To support workforce planning a workflow has been developed to enable service leaders to effectively focus on succession and workforce planning and directorates to develop plans for their workforce. The combination of the workflow and the coded pathways for development will help leaders foster the behaviours and skills needed to take a proactive and forward thinking approach to maintaining their teams and services and also provide colleagues with clear channels of training to progress in their careers.</p> <p>People Services Data Dashboards covering key workforce information continue to be available on the council's intranet. To further improve the analysis and reporting of this information scorecards are being implemented which cover a range of workforce data including</p>	April 2017	Head of people and information governance



Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/ benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
					<p>staff establishment, age, gender etc. These will enable Managers to further interrogate data and identify specific workforce issues. The data will be near real time as they are directly linked to the HR system and will therefore provide more timely information. They will also be reported to and used by Department Management teams and Senior leadership team in order to drive effective decision making based on workforce information.</p> <p>In May 2016 Cabinet agreed to commission a strategic programme of whole-authority work called 'Future Monmouthshire' that will see the development of a new operating model for the Council in order to equip it to meet its goals amidst increasing change and uncertainty. The new operating model will have a clear purpose: to create solutions to some of the county's biggest challenges and will facilitate work on articulating future workforce requirements.</p>	Informed by Future Monmouthshire	Head of Resources

### New proposals for improvement

Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/ benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
P1	Develop further workforce data to include staff establishment, contract status, vacancies, agency use, age, gender, and grade/pay distribution, to better inform future workforce planning activity.	Better understanding and management of the current workforce through better information	✓	Yes	See response to proposal "Original CA report P8" above		
P2	Improve oversight and ongoing implementation of the staff appraisal process.	Assurance that managers are implementing recent changes to the staff appraisal process	✓	Yes	See response to proposal "Original CA report P3" above		

Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/ benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
	In particular: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ensure staff appraisal completion is uploaded onto the Council's Hub to accurately reflect the numbers of staff in receipt of an annual appraisal; and</li> <li>increase the appraisal completion rate.</li> </ul>	"Check in Check out" appropriately					
P3	Further develop HR ICT systems to better support operational managers and improve recording of sickness and disciplinary matters.	Better informed management of sickness absence		Yes	<p>A significant amount of work has been and will continue to be undertaken to make mandatory as well as developmental changes and upgrades to Human Resources ICT systems, including the current system in place for reporting sickness which continues to be a focus for development. It is planned that these will increase usability for officers and managers.</p> <p>As well as developing ICT systems, which includes providing clear links between policy, procedure and workflow documents within the recording system, an equal focus has been placed on assisting managers to complete their responsibilities in recording of sickness and disciplinary matters efficiently as possible to improve recording. This includes managing attendance training which has been attended by over 50 managers and timelier reporting of information for managers to review.</p> <p>Regular meetings between HR advisors and operational managers will be further supported by a newly developed HR report template to enable the more frequent review and progress of HR issues, including sickness and</p>	March 2017	Head of people and information governance

Ref	Recommendation	Intended outcome/ benefit	High priority (yes/no)	Accepted (yes/no)	Management response	Completion date	Responsible officer
					disciplinary matters, to strengthen their management.		
P4	Improve the evaluation of HR improvement actions to better measure the impact and outcomes.	Assurance that the Council is implementing its planned improvements to HR management		Yes	<p>To provide clarity of purpose and direction a People and Organisational Strategy was developed, underpinned by an ambitious delivery work programme. Progress against the strategy in 2015/16 has been reported and a People Services annual report was completed in June 2016, which provides a summary of activity against areas for improvement during the year.</p> <p>This annual report will act as a base line for completion of the 2016/17 annual monitoring report. Which will bring together the different elements of People Services to evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of the service.</p>	July 2017	Head of people and information governance

This page is intentionally left blank

<b>AUDIT COMMITTEE WORKPLAN 2016/17</b>	
<b>21ST APRIL 2016</b>	
<i>Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – Tuesday 12th April - end of day</i>	
Annual Governance Statement, 2015/16	Andrew Wathan
Internal Audit Section, Operational Plan 2016/17 - Draft	Andrew Wathan
Internal Audit Section Progress report on Unsatisfactory/Unsound Audit Opinions	Andrew Wathan
2016 Audit Plan	WAO
Early Departures & vacant posts	Peter Davies
Issued raised by member of public regarding Chepstow School	Kellie Beirne
Response to Unsatisfactory Audit Opinion of Passenger Transport Unit from Audit Committee meeting on 22nd October 2015	Richard Cope
Audit Committee Annual Report 2015/16, Annual report 2014/15	Andrew Wathan
<b>26TH MAY 2016</b>	
<i>Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – 10am Monday 16th May 2016</i>	
<i>Finalised reports to Committee Section – end of day Monday 16th May 2016</i>	
<b>SUBJECT</b>	<b>AUTHOR</b>
Annual Governance Statement - final	Andrew Wathan
Internal Audit Section Operational Plan 2016 17 - draft	Andrew Wathan
Internal Annual Section Outturn report 2015/16	Andrew Wathan
Update on Special Investigations	Andrew Wathan
<b>30TH JUNE 2016</b>	
<i>Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – end of day Monday 20th June</i>	
<i>Finalised reports to Committee Section- 9 am - Tuesday 21st June</i>	
2015/16 Treasury Outturn Report - to follow	Jon Davies/Lesley Russell
Statement of Accounts 2015/16 - report, appendices include Summary of accounts information 2015/16, Statement of Accounts (prior to Audit 2015/16, Welsh Church Fund Accounts 2015/16	1. 2. 3 MCC Mark Howcroft/Jon Davies
Review of Reserves	Joy Robson
CPR Exemptions 6 monthly	Andrew Wathan
Improvement Plan - Certificate of Compliance & Regulators Feedback	Matt Gatehouse
Corporate Assessment - Action Plan Progress report	Matt Gatehouse
Corporate Assessment Follow Up:Governance Review	WAO
Financial Resilience Assessment	WAO

## 15TH SEPTEMBER 2016

**Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – Thursday 1st September**

**Finalised reports to Committee Section -Friday 2nd September**

MCC Audited Accounts 2015/16 (formal approval)	WAO/Mark Howcroft/Jon Davies
ISA 260 report - MCC Accounts	WAO/Mark Howcroft/Jon Davies
Internal Audit Charter	Andrew Wathan
Internal Audit Progress report 2016/17 quarter 1	Andrew Wathan
Annual Improvement report	WAO (Matt Gatehouse)
Corporate Assessment follow up:Performance Management	Matt Gatehouse

## 13TH OCTOBER 2016 - cancelled

## 17TH NOVEMBER 2016

**Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – 12 noon 7th November 2016**

**Finalised reports to Committee Section – end of day 7th November 2016**

Presentation on Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS)	Andrew Wathan
Corporate Assessment follow on review - Information Technology	WAO
Whole Authority Complaints, Comments & Compliments report	Annette Evans
Half Yearly Treasury Update	Joy Robson
Internal Audit progress report 2016/17 - quarter 2	Andrew Wathan
Unsatisfactory Audit Opinions	Andrew Wathan
People Services Annual Report & workforce plan	Peter Davies
Review of MRP	Mark Howcroft
Quarterly Monitoring of Reserves - Quarter 2	Mark Howcroft

## 15TH DECEMBER 2016

**Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – 12 noon Monday 5th December**

**Finalised reports to Committee Section –end of day Monday 5th December**

Wales Audit Office Proposals for Improvement progress reports	Richard Jones
Overview of Performance Management Arrangements	Richard Jones
Zero hour contracts	Tracey Harry
ISA 260 reports - Trust Funds	WAO
Audited Welsh Church Fund Trust Fund Accounts 2015/16	Mark Howcroft
Audited Monmouthshire Farm School Trust Fund Accounts 2015/16	Mark Howcroft
Early Departures & Redundancy Costs	Peter Davies
Exemptions from CPRS	Andrew Wathan
Strategic Risk Assessment 2016	Richard Jones

## 2ND FEBRUARY 2017

**Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl – mid day 23rd January 2017**

**Finalised reports to Committee Section - end of day 23rd January 2017**

Q3 Progress report	Andrew Wathan
Corporate Assessment Follow on review - Human Resources	WAO
<b>16TH MARCH 2017</b>	
<b><i>Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl –</i></b>	
<b><i>Finalised reports to Committee Section</i></b>	
Joint Progress report	Mark & WAO
Internal audit 2017/18 plan - draft	Andrew Wathan
Quarterly Monitoring of Reserves - qtr 3	Mark Howcroft
Review of Anti Fraud corruption policy	Andrew Wathan
<b>Apr-17</b>	
<b><i>Deadline for finalised reports to Cheryl –</i></b>	
<b><i>Finalised reports to Committee Section –</i></b>	
Unsatisfactory audit Opinions	Andrew Wathan
Annual Governance Statement	Andrew Wathan
Implementation of Audit Recommendations	Andrew Wathan

This page is intentionally left blank